## **CITY OF SAN ANTONIO**

# **OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION**

OV 0 7 2018 SAMANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
OFFICIAL MINUTES
17 October 2018

The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 3:05 PM, in the Board Room at the Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo.

• The meeting was called to order by Vice Chair Fetzer, and the roll was called by the Management Analyst.

PRESENT: Fish, Wolff, Martinez-Florez, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

ABSENT: Guarino, Garza, Connor, Carpenter, Grube

- Chairman's Statement
- Announcements

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

A motion was made by Commissioner Laffoon and seconded by Commissioner Wolff to nominate Commissioner Fish as the acting vice chair.

**AYES:** 

Wolff, Martinez-Florez, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS:

None.

**ABSTAIN:** 

Fish.

THE MOTION CARRIED.

• The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda, which consisted of:

0	Item #1, Case No.	2018-500	311 CEDAR
0	Item #2, Case No.	2018-470	146 CROFTON
0	Item #5, Case No.	2018-509	1501 S FLORES
0	Item #6, Case No.	2018-503	112 LINDELL
0	Item #7, Case No.	2018-514	400 EAGLELAND
0	Item #8, Case No.	2018-502	OLD SPANISH TRAIL - 3668 FREDERICKSBURG
0	Item #9, Case No.	2018-471	502 E MULBERRY
0	Item #10, Case No.	2018-497	104 N ST MARYS
0	Item #11, Case No.	2018-498	111 W CROCKETT - ANTENNA
0	Item #12, Case No.	2018-517	215 NELSON
0	Item #13, Case No.	2018-518	545 WICKES
0	Item #19, Case No.	2018-461	603 KAMPMANN

Item #3 was moved to individual consideration by the applicant.

Item #4 was moved to individual consideration by staff as there were Citizens to be Heard.

Item #19 was moved to the consent agenda by the applicant and the case manager.

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Fish and seconded by Martinez-Flores to approve the Consent Agenda with staff stipulations.

AYES: Fish, Wolff, Martinez-Florez, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS: None.

THE MOTION CARRIED.

MAR FORM

• Item #3. HDRC NO. 2018-499

**Applicant:** Chris Wilke/Bakers Signs

ADDRESS: 118 Soledad

## **REQUEST:**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install signage at 118 Soledad. Within this request, the applicant has proposed to install the following:

- 1. One (1) set of halo illuminated channel letters to be mounted on the front (east) façade of the structure to read "Hampton Inn & Suites, Home 2 Suites, and By Hilton". This sign will be located at the street level and will feature a total size of approximately 5' 7" in height and 9' 9" in width for a size of approximately 54.4 square feet.
- 2. One (1) aluminum blade sign to read "Hampton Inn & Suites by Hilton" on the south face and "Home 2 Suites by Hilton" on the north face to feature 32' 7" in height and 5' 10" in width. This sign will be located approximately 39' above the street level on the west (front) façade.

#### **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

Staff recommends approval based on findings a through g with the stipulation that the proposed blade sign be reduced to twenty-five (25) feet in height as noted in finding f.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made and seconded to approve with staff stipulations.

AYES: Fish, Wolff, Martinez-Florez, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS: None.

THE MOTION CARRIED

Item #4. HDRC NO. 2018-501

**ADDRESS:** 204 E Houston

APPLICANT: Marcello Martinez/1718 Architecture

#### **REQUEST:**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1. Install a new, hanging canopy sign to feature forty-two (42) inches in width and thirty (30) inches in height for a total square footage of 17.5 square feet, including both sides. The proposed sign will feature lexan faces with internal LED lights.
- 2. Install a pedestrian menu board adjacent to the public right of way to feature a height of eighteen (18) inches and a width of twenty-four (24) inches.

#### **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

- 1. Staff recommends approval of item #1 based on finding b with the following stipulations:
- i. That the proposed sign feature an aluminum or metal face in place of the Lexan face.
- ii. That the proposed sign feature indirect lighting or lighting that does not result in the entire cabinet being illuminated.
- 2. Staff recommends approval of item #2 based on finding c with the following stipulation:
- i. That the name or logo of the establishment not be places on the menu board structure at any time.

#### CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

Cecelia H. Martinez in opposition.

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Fish and seconded by Commissioner Wolff to approve with staff stipulations.

**AYES:** 

Fish, Wolff, Martinez-Florez, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS:

None.

THE MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner Carpenter arrived at 3:30 pm.

#### INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION

• Item #14. HDRC NO. 2018-396

**ADDRESS: 304 Pierce** 

APPLICANT:

Jorge Acosta

#### **REOUEST:**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a two story, single family residential structure at 304 Pierce, located within the Government Hill Historic District.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

Staff does not recommend approval at this time. Generally, staff finds the updated site plan to be appropriate; however, the applicant should modify the proposed massing to be consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines and appropriate for the Government Hill Historic District.

#### CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

Rose Hill of Government Hill Alliance in support.

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Fish and seconded by Commissioner Wolff to conceptually approve.

AYES: Fish, Wolff, Martinez-Florez, Carpenter, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS: None.

THE MOTION CARRIED

• Item #15. HDRC NO. 2018-383

**ADDRESS:** 318 W Houston

**APPLICANT:** Michael Ray/Overland Partners

## **REQUEST:**

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to construct an addition atop of the existing addition at the rear of the Alameda Theater. The existing addition that will be constructed atop of was constructed in 2012.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

Staff recommends approval based on findings a through p with the following stipulations:

That the applicant incorporate additional fenestration at the southeast corner as well as along San Pedro Creek below the proposed canopy as noted in finding k.

## CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Fish and seconded by Commissioner Fetzer to approve as submitted at seen at hearing.

AYES: Fish, Wolff, Martinez-Florez, Carpenter, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS: None.

THE MOTION CARRIED

• Item #16. HDRC NO. 2018-451

**ADDRESS:** 607 E Locust

**APPLICANT:** Jose Calzada/Architectura SA

## **REQUEST:**

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to construct three, three story townhomes on the vacant lot addressed 607 E Locust.

#### **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

Staff does not recommend conceptual approval based on findings a though q. Staff recommends that the applicant address

the following stipulations prior to returning to the HDRC:

- i. That the applicant proposes a primary and accessory structure condition to be more consistent with historic development patterns in the district as noted in finding f.
- ii. That the applicant explores 2.5-story massing options to respond to the dominant historic massing context of the neighborhood as noted in finding g.
- iii. That the applicant incorporates roof forms that are more consistent with the typologies found in the Tobin Hill Historic District as noted in finding i.
- iv. That the applicant incorporates a foundation height of at least 18 inches to be more consistent with the foundation heights of nearby historic structures as noted in finding h.
- v. That the applicant utilizes a front setback that is more consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines as noted in finding d.

vi. That the applicant develops a modified street elevation that incorporates window openings on the first floor and a front porch design that is more consistent with the development pattern of the district as noted in findings j and k.

vii. That the applicant proposes a fenestration pattern, window opening proportions, and materials that are more consistent with the Guidelines, the OHP Window Policy document, and the historic examples found in the Tobin Hill Historic District as noted in finding j.

viii. That the applicant reduces the proposed driveway width as noted in finding q.

#### CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

Ricki Kushner, 405 E Mytle, on behalf of THCA, in opposition.

Celia H. Ramirez in support.

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Fish and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter for denial of conceptual approval.

AYES: None.

NAYS: Fish, Wolff, Martinez-Florez, Carpenter, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

THE MOTION FAILED

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Fish and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to refer to the Design Review Committee.

AYES: Fish, Wolff, Martinez-Florez, Carpenter, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS: None.

THE MOTION CARRIED

#### • Item #17. HDRC NO. 2018-515

**ADDRESS:** 311 E Courtland and 2002 McCullough

**APPLICANT:** Patrick Christensen

## **REQUEST:**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct nine single family structures on the lots currently addressed 2002 McCullough Ave and 311 E Courtland Place. Six of the nine proposed structures are within or on the boundary of the Tobin Hill Historic District. Only these six will be reviewed as part of this request.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

Sufficient documentation for review has not been provided. Staff does not recommend conceptual approval at this time. The existing hardscaping shared with the adjacent property is not indicated on the submitted site plans, the indicated lot lines differ from city data, dimensions are not indicated on the plans and elevations, and an insufficient analysis of the surrounding context has been provided. Staff recommends that the applicant provides the following information and addresses the following inconsistencies prior to returning to the HDRC:

i. That the applicant explores ways to increase the setback on E Courtland Place to be more consistent with the adjacent historic structures as noted in finding e. The applicant is required to

submit a full setback analysis of the north and south side of E Courtland, at minimum, for an application to be considered complete.

- ii. That fewer units are explored to be more in keeping with the established development pattern within the district based on finding c.
- iii. That the applicant develops individualized street elevations for each unit to be more consistent with the development pattern of the district as noted in finding n.
- iv. The applicant explores 1.5 to 2.5-story massing options or prototypes within the district boundary to respond to the dominant historic massing context of the historic neighborhood.
- v. That the applicant incorporates a foundation height of at least 18 inches to be more consistent with the foundation heights of nearby historic structures as noted in finding h.
- vi. That the applicant proposes a fenestration pattern, window opening proportions, and materials that are more consistent with the Guidelines, the OHP Window Policy document, and the historic examples found in the Tobin Hill Historic District
- vii. That the applicant submits an existing conditions site plan indicating all existing hardscaping on the lot as noted in finding q.

#### CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

Richard Moore, 816 McCullough, in support.

Patti Ziontz, 107 King William, First Vice President of the San Antonio Conservation Society, in opposition.

Ricki Kushner, 405 E Myrtle, Tobin Hill Community Association, in opposition.

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Wolff and seconded by Commissioner Martinez-Flores to conceptually approve with staff stipulations 1, 3, 4, 5, 6, and 7.

AYES: Wolff, Martinez-Florez, Carpenter, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS: Fish.

THE MOTION CARRIED

Item #18. HDRC NO. 2018-513

ADDRESS: 111 W Crockett

**APPLICANT:** Derek Langford

Tenant (bar owner) present.

## **REQUEST:**

The applicant is requesting approval of a comprehensive signage package for Suite 250 to include:

- 1. Vinyl window graphics on the S Presa façade to total 42 square feet.
- 2. A projecting sign on the S Presa façade to total 8 square feet.
- 3. Vinyl window graphics on the Riverwalk façade to total approximately 65 square feet.
- 4. A projecting sign on the Riverwalk façade to total 8 square feet.

#### **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

Item 1, Staff recommends approval of the vinyl window graphics on the S Presa façade based on finding d.

Item 2, Staff recommends approval of the projecting sign on the S Presa façade based on finding e with the following stipulation:

- i. That the sign be installed in the mortar, not in the masonry unit, of the façade.
- ii. That the applicant provides final details on the external lighting strategy to staff for review and approval.

Items 3 and 4, Staff does not recommend approval of the Riverwalk signage at this time based on findings a through f.

Staff recommends that the applicant reduces the number of signs and the total square footage on the Riverwalk to be consistent with RIO signage standards.

#### CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Fish and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve with items #1, 2, 3, and 4 with staff stipulations.

AYES: Fish, Wolff, Martinez-Florez, Carpenter, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS: None.

THE MOTION CARRIED

Item #19, Case No.2018-461, 603 KAMPMANN was approved on consent agenda.

• Item #20. HDRC NO. 2018-445

**ADDRESS:** 

119 Buford

APPLICANT:

Mark Grenado

### **REQUEST:**

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to construct a one story, single family residential structure on the vacant lot at 119 Buford, located within the Dignowity Hill Historic District.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends conceptual approval of the proposed massing and form as noted in findings c. d and f.

Prior to receiving full conceptual approval and prior to returning to the Commission for final approval, staff finds that the applicant should address the following items:

- i. A setback that is greater than those found historically on this block should be used. The applicant should provide documentation noting that a setback that is greater than those existing is proposed as noted in finding b.
- ii. That a foundation height that is comparable to those found historically on this street be installed as noted in finding e.
- iii. That double-hung, one-over-one wood windows or aluminum-clad wood windows be used. Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate

- sill detail (need to add detail here). Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.
- iv. That all mechanical equipment be screened from view at the public right of way as noted in finding j.
- v. That the driveway not exceed ten (10) feet in width and be designed as to not present front yard parking as noted in finding k.
- vi. That a landscaping plan be submitted as noted in finding l.

## **CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:**

Lulu François, of Dignowity Hill Concerned Citizens, in support with comments.

Arvis Holland, of Dignowity Hill Neighborhood Association, in support.

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Fish and seconded by Commissioner Wolff to approve with staff stipulations.

AYES: Fish, Wolff, Martinez-Florez, Carpenter, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS: None.

THE MOTION CARRIED

• Item #21. HDRC NO. 2018-481

ADDRESS:

1811 N Palmetto

**APPLICANT:** 

Diana Orosco

## **REQUEST:**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to replace the existing, standing seam metal roof with an asphalt shingle roof.

### **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

Staff does not recommend approval based on finding b. Staff recommends that a standing seam metal roof be installed to feature panels that are 18 to 21 inches in width, seams that are 1 to 2 inches in height, a crimped ridge seam and a standard galvalume finish.

A roof inspection is to be scheduled with OHP staff 24 hours prior to the start of roof replacement to ensure that a crimped ridge seam is to be installed.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

COMMISSION ACTION: None.

Postponed by the Applicant.

• Item #22. HDRC NO. 2018-495

ADDRESS: 143 Sexa

143 Sexauer Drive

**APPLICANT:** Leticia Huerta

**REQUEST:** 

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a one story, single family residential structure at 143 Sexauer, located within the Mission Historic District.

#### **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

Staff recommends approval of the proposed massing and form as noted in findings c, d, f and g. Prior to a receiving a recommendation for final approval, staff finds that the applicant should address the following items.

- i. A setback that is greater than those found historically on this block should be used. The applicant should provide documentation noting that a setback that is greater than those existing is proposed as noted in finding b.
- ii. That a foundation height that is comparable to those found historically on this street be installed as noted in finding e.
- iii. That the proposed stone veneer be removed as noted in finding h.
- iv. That double-hung, one-over-one wood windows or aluminum-clad wood windows be used.. Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail (need to add detail here). Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.
- v. That all mechanical equipment be screened from view at the public right of way as noted in finding j.
- vi. That the driveway not exceed ten (10) feet in width as noted in finding k.
- vii. That a landscaping plan be submitted as noted in finding l.

#### CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded to conceptually approve with staff stipulations and work with staff on the landscape plan.

AYES: Fish, Wolff, Martinez-Florez, Carpenter, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS: None.

THE MOTION CARRIED

• Item #23. HDRC NO. 2018-510

**ADDRESS:** 

118 Sweet

APPLICANT:

Andreas Wurzer/Andreas Wurzer Construction Inc

## **REQUEST:**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a two story, rear accessory structure at 118 Sweet.

#### **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

Staff recommends approval based on findings a through f with the following stipulations:

i. That wood or aluminum clad wood windows be installed that feature meeting rails that are no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and an architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.

ii. That a wood exterior door be installed and that the proposed Hardie siding feature an exposure of four (4) inches and a smooth finish.

#### **CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:**

Patti Ziontz, 107 King William, First Vice Present of the San Antonio Conservation Society, in opposition.

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Fish to approve with staff stipulations.

AYES: Fish, Wolff, Martinez-Florez, Carpenter, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS: None.

THE MOTION CARRIED

Commissioner Wolff departed at 5:30 pm.

• Item #24. HDRC NO. 2018-511

**ADDRESS:** 636 Mission Street

**APPLICANT:** Jeffrey Szarek

## **REQUEST:**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to perform exterior modifications to a rear addition at 636 Mission including the removal of five (5) windows on the rear (east) façade, one (1) window on the south façade and the removal of one door on the south façade. Within the proposed fenestration modifications, existing windows will be relocated from their original locations.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

Staff does not recommend approval based on findings a and b.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

## **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Fish and seconded by Commissioner Martinez-Flores to approve with the stipulation that the windows and doors be salvaged.

AYES: Fish, Martinez-Florez, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS: Carpenter, Bowman THE MOTION CARRIED

#### • Item #25. HDRC NO. 2018-512

**ADDRESS:** 1650 E Pyron Avenue

**APPLICANT:** Michael & Cynthia Matson

## **REQUEST:**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1. Replace the existing, aluminum windows with windows.
- 2. Modify two window openings on the front façade for bedroom egress on the front façade and one bedroom window on the rear façade.

#### **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

Staff recommends approval based on findings a through d with the following stipulations:

- i. That brick match the original in any in-filled locations and that the proposed cedar or wood shake shingles be comparable in size to those that currently exist (to the left and right of the dining room window openings).
- ii. That the one over one windows should only modify the portion of the windows that matches the new width. The original, narrow window profiles to the right and left of each should remain as they currently exist.

#### CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Fish to approve with staff stipulations with the exception of an expression of infill material with brick to show distinctive of original window opening shape and size.

AYES: Fish, Martinez-Florez, Carpenter, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS: None.

THE MOTION CARRIED

• Item #26. HDRC NO. 2018-496

**ADDRESS:** 122 Heiman

**APPLICANT:** Absent, Richard Hope/RC Hope Group, LLC

#### **REQUEST:**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct an exterior stair on the west façade from the third story to the ground level. This addition will require the modification of an existing window opening into a door opening with a transom window.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

Staff recommends approval based on findings a through c with the stipulation that the applicant revise the proposed staircase to feature a structural system that does not require penetrations into the historic façade.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Fish and seconded to postpone the request to the next scheduled HDRC hearing in the absence of the applicant.

AYES: Fish, Martinez-Florez, Carpenter, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS: None.

THE MOTION CARRIED

• Item #27. HDRC NO. 2018-508

**ADDRESS:** 

1703 N New Braunfels

**APPLICANT:** 

Comet Signs representing Circle K

**REQUEST:** 

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Install three (3) LED light bars to the existing fuel canopy.

2. Install one (1), internally illuminated wall sign to feature a total of five (5) feet in height and 4' -

2" in width to feature the Circle K logo on the south side of the existing convenience store.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

- 1. Staff does not recommend approval of item #1, the proposed LED banding based on finding b.
- 2. Staff recommends approval of item #2, the proposed wall sign based on finding c with the following stipulation:
- i. That the sign feature a metal face.
- ii. That the sign feature indirect lighting.

**CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:** None.

### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Fish and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve item #2 with staff stipulations.

AYES: Fish, Martinez-Florez, Carpenter, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS: None.

THE MOTION CARRIED

The HDRC heard item #31 out of order.

• Item #31. HDRC NO. 2018-440

ADDRESS:

215 Devine

APPLICANT:

Nicole Nadvornik

**REQUEST:** 

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1. Install gravel driveways and walkways.
- 2. Replace the poured concrete walkway with segmented concrete pavers.
- 3. Remove natural lawn to install artificial turf and crushed rocks.

#### **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

- 1. Staff recommends approval of the crushed granite driveway and flanking walkways based on finding c with the stipulation that the driveways are no wider than ten (10) feet.
- 2. Staff does not recommend installation of the segmented concrete paver walkway based on finding
- d. The poured simple concrete walkway should be restored.
- 3. Staff does not recommend installation of artificial turf based on finding e. The natural lawn should be restored or an appropriate xeriscaping plan is submitted for review.

#### CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Fish to approve with staff stipulations, approve the request for the crushed granite driveway, deny the request for artificial grass, and deny the request for the concrete pad walkway.

AYES: Fish, Martinez-Florez, Carpenter, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS: Bowman

THE MOTION CARRIED

• Item #28. HDRC NO. 2018-520

ADDRESS: 2020 W Huisache

**APPLICANT:** Andrew Gooding

## **REQUEST:**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to replace approximately 15 one over one wood windows with new one over one white vinyl windows.

#### RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval of the window replacement based on findings a through c with the following stipulations:

- i. That the applicant retains the windows that are not deteriorated beyond repair as determined by staff. Photographic evidence or a site visit, in conjunction with an updated window schedule, is required to delineate which windows will be restored and which will be replaced. If the applicant believes all windows to be deteriorated beyond repair, the aforementioned site visit and updated documentation may be submitted for staff review and approval prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- ii. That the replacement windows be wood in lieu of the proposed vinyl. The applicant must submit a final window specification for the proposed windows to staff for review and approval. Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.

#### CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

## **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Fish and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve with staff stipulations.

AYES: Fish, Martinez-Florez, Carpenter, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS: None.

THE MOTION CARRIED

• Item #29. HDRC NO. 2018-455

ADDRESS:

919 E Crockett

APPLICANT:

Amber Caddell/Design Tech Homes

## **REQUEST:**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a 2-story single family residential structure on the vacant lot addressed 919 E Crockett St.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

Staff recommends conceptual approval based on the documentation provided and findings a through r with the following stipulations:

- i. That the applicant explores 1.5 story massing to be more consistent with the development pattern of the block as noted in finding d and submits a final, detailed, and accurate height study that places the proposed new construction in context with the existing historic structures on the block.
- ii. That the applicant extends the front porch footprint to engage the street as noted in finding e. The porch should project a minimum of 5 feet to be consistent with historic precedents on the block and in the district.
- ii. That the applicant installs wood or aluminum-clad wood windows in lieu of the proposed vinyl windows and submits a final window specification to staff for review and approval. Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.

#### CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

Lulu Francois, Dignowity Hill Concerned Citizens, in support with comments.

Arvis Holland, Dignowity Hill Neighborhood Association, in support.

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Laffoon to conceptually approve with staff stipulations.

AYES: Fish, Martinez-Florez, Carpenter, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS: None.

THE MOTION CARRIED

• Item #30. HDRC NO. 2018-488

ADDRESS:

125 City Street

**APPLICANT:** 

**Doug Robins** 

## **REQUEST:**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a rear carport measuring approximately 800 square feet.

#### **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

Staff does not recommend approval based on findings a through g. Staff recommends that the applicant address the various inconsistencies with the Guidelines prior to returning to the HDRC.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Fish and seconded by Commissioner Laffoon to approve new submission with staff stipulations.

AYES: Fish, Martinez-Florez, Carpenter, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS: None.

THE MOTION CARRIED

• Item #32. HDRC NO. 2018-507

**ADDRESS:** 

614 Barbe Street

**REQUEST:** 

**APPLICANT:** 

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1) Replace the existing garage door with two new vinyl windows on the southern rear accessory structure.
- 2) Replace both existing garage doors with two new vinyl windows and relocate the door on the northern rear accessory structure.
- 3) Remove a second-story window opening on the northern rear accessory structure.
- 4) Reapply stucco to the front porch enclosure.

Christine Jacques

## **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

- 1. Staff does not recommend approval of item #1, the modifications of the fenestration of the rear right accessory structure based on finding b.
  - 2. Staff does not recommend approval of item #2, the modifications of the fenestration of the rear left accessory structure based on finding c.
  - 3. Staff does not recommend approval of item #3, window removal on the rear left accessory structure based on finding d.
  - 4. Staff does not recommend approval of item #4, applying new stucco to the covered porch based on finding e. The applicant is eligible for administrative approval to repair the existing stucco in place; however, the shape of the historic front porch arched opening must be retained.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

## **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Fish to refer to the Design Review Committee.

AYES: Fish, Martinez-Florez, Carpenter, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS: None.

THE MOTION CARRIED

• Item #33. HDRC NO. 2018-506

**ADDRESS:** 1131 SE Military Drive

**APPLICANT:** Steve Tire, sign tech

## **REQUEST:**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1) Install new signage featuring internally-illuminated channel letters and a total of 101 square feet.
- 2) Reface front and back signage panels on existing multi-tenant pylon sign.

#### **RECOMMENDATIONS:**

Staff recommends approval of the new signage based on finding b through d with the stipulation that storefront signage features reverse lit channel letters, featuring metal construction, instead of internally illuminated, vinyl-face channel letters.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Fish and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve as submitted.

AYES: Fish, Martinez-Florez, Carpenter, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS: None.

THE MOTION CARRIED

Approval of the Historic and Design Review Commission Meeting minutes from 3 October 2018.

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Fish and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve meeting minutes.

AYES: Fish, Martinez-Florez, Carpenter, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS: None.
THE MOTION CARRIED

Move to adjourn:

## **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made to adjourn.

AYES: Fish, Martinez-Florez, Carpenter, Bowman, Fetzer, Laffoon.

NAYS: None.
THE MOTION CARRIED

- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 7:10 PM.

APPROVED

Michael Guarino E & E 12018
Chair